Received: May 2023 Accepted: June 2023 DOI: https://doi.org/10.58262/ks.v11i02.169

Green Accounting, Environmental Accounting, and Carbon Accounting: Is It the Same?

Dwi Indah Lestari¹*, Patria Prasetio Adi², Siti Kustinah³, Dwi Jayanti⁴, Vita Citra Mulyandini⁵, Meilani Purwanti⁶, Aceng Kurniawan⁷

Abstract

Green accounting is a concept that has yet to be widely applied in Indonesia. With pressure from stakeholders, companies are now implementing green accounting concepts. research on green accounting has been thoroughly investigated. However, the terminology of green accounting is expanding into terms such as environmental accounting and carbon accounting. The primary objective of this research is to examine the distinctions between terminology for each notion in an effort to clarify these ideas. In various literature, these three terms are used in different contexts. This type of research is a systematic literature review (SLR) conducted using qualitative methods, collecting journal articles from Elsevier and Emerald with period until June 2023. The results of this study show that, by definition, green accounting and environmental accounting refer to the same thing; therefore, this terminology can be used interchangeably. However, carbon accounting is different from green and environmental accounting. The results of this study are expected to contribute to researchers and businesses, governments, and policymakers by providing accurate terminology to ensure consistency with the concept.

Keywords: Environmental Accounting, Green Accounting, Carbon Accounting, Terminology

Introduction

Currently, climate change has become a major global concern. According to United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), the climate change phenomenon can be seen in the shifting of snow and rainfall patterns, extreme climate events and the rising global temperatures. Human actions have led to a number of environmental challenges, such as the overuse of natural resources that drives climate change (Weng, Chen and Chen, 2015). The scientific data shows that the concerns posed by climate change must be addressed by business, industry, and society (Linnenluecke, Birt and Griffiths, 2015).

Therefore, governments must participate in reducing the effects of climate change by passing laws, such as the Paris Agreement of 2016, which puts pressure on countries to fully execute the global reforms that have been agreed upon (Wade and Griffiths, 2020). By integrating environmentally friendly practices throughout the manufacturing process, maximizing production efficiency, and revealing greenhouse gas emissions, accounting, as a social science, may benefit society and the environment (Hopper, 2019). The concept of green accounting was introduced in the 1990s, but this research is underdeveloped due to a lack of academic interest and the tendency of businesses to disregard it (Gray and Laughlin, 2012).

¹Universitas Jenderal Achmad Yani. Email: dwiindah@ak.unjani.ac.id

² Universitas Jenderal Achmad Yani

³ Universitas Jenderal Achmad Yan

⁴Universitas Jenderal Achmad Yani

⁵ Universitas Jenderal Achmad Yani ⁶ Universitas Teknologi Digital

⁷ Universitas Teknologi Digital

⁷ Universitas Teknologi Digital

2360 Green Accounting, Environmental Accounting, and Carbon Accounting: Is It the Same?

As a result, people use a variety of terms associated with green accounting, which can lead to confusion. Green accounting environmental accounting, and carbon accounting are frequently used interchangeably, although it is unclear whether they refer to the same concept. Therefore, it is important to define each term(Akman, Cairns, Comar, & Hrozencik, 2014).

Environmental accounting is a substantial area in the field of accounting science (Rounaghi, 2019). In his research, Rounaghi (2019) interchanges the terms green accounting and environmental economics. This statement raises the question of why Rounaghi (2019) used the term environmental economics rather than environmental accounting, because, in contrast, Gray & Laughlin (2012) define green accounting as environmental accounting. Similarly, Dalmazzone & La Notte (2013) use the term of environmental accounting to refer the same thing. To make it more complicated, Stechemesser & Guenther (2012) said that carbon accounting is a subset of environmental accounting but Ascui & Lovell (2011) state that the definition of carbon accounting is difficult to comprehend and problematic (Miller & Amos, 2017).

This study's objective is to explain the concepts of green accounting, environmental accounting, and carbon accounting by defining the terminology associated with each variable. This research employs a Qualitative Systematic Literature Review (SLR) methodology, and it is expected to contribute to the provision of benefits not only for researchers, but also for businesses, the government, and policymakers, by providing the appropriate terminology to ensure their actions are consistent with the concept.

Literature Review

In many works of literature, researchers are using green accounting and environmental accounting interchangeably, for example: Gray and Laughlin (2012) and Deegan (2013).

Gray and Laughlin (2012) state in their article "... "green accounting" or "accounting for the environment" drew heavily from the longer and more substantial social accounting literature and practice." The authors consider that green accounting and environmental accounting refer to the similar thing. In addition, Stanojević, Vranes and Gökalp (2010) provide a new perspective that differentiates between green accounting from a business-level perspective and green accounting from a national-level perspective. However, they still refer to green accounting as environmental accounting. While Deegan (2013) added that environmental and green accounting can be seen as oxymorons. In addition, some author, such as Solomon and Thomson (2009) and Lockhart and M.R., (2015) equates environmental accounting with social accounting. In the meantime, according to Ascui and Lovell (2011), carbon accounting means different things to different people. Ascui and Lovell (2011) argue that there are five frames of carbon accounting, and one of those frame is social/environmental carbon accounting (Messinis & Vosniakos, 2020).

Methods

The SLR method has demonstrated that all available information will be systematically located and collated on an effect (Davis et al., 2014). This study refers to Stechemesser & Guenther (2012) systematic literature review-based research. The only information sources used for this study were journal articles, and there were no restrictions on geography or subject matter as long as the articles were available in English that available on Scopus, Proquest, and Google Scholar databases(Giraldi, Corrêa, Schuelter-Trevisol, & Gonçalves, 2019).

In the same manner as Stechemesser & Guenther (2012), this study will employ four stages, including www.KurdishStudies.net

the selection of research questions through an article database, the determination of relevant article criteria, the application and development of review criteria methods, and the synthesis and identification of research results.

The steps are divided into four stages and organized as follows:

- 1. Choosing a research question
- 2. Determination of relevant article criteria
- 3. Application and development of review criteria methods
- 4. Synthesis and identification of research results

Result and Discussions

The organization of this section follows the review methodology described above. We describe the shorting process first, and then, finally, we concentrate on and characterize the focus and content of explicit definitions of green accounting, environmental accounting, and carbon accounting (Wu, W & Li, N 2022).

Choosing a research question

To meet the goal of this study, we only look at how green accounting, environmental accounting, and carbon accounting are defined explicitly.

Determination of relevant article criteria

This study analysed related articles that were published until June 2023. Several keywords closely relevant to the research question are employed to identify academic articles that are significant and pertinent to the research questions outlined for this study. We set the maximum number of results to 1,000 articles into the Publish or Perish software and uses the following title keywords to find relevant literature:

- a) "Green accounting" definition
- b) "Environmental accounting" definition
- c) "Carbon accounting" definition

The software then creates a list that can be saved into excel. The list contains the description of the number of citations, the author, title, publisher, related website, and Digital Object Identifier (DOI) of the article. After that, we select relevant articles by using the filter feature in excel, selecting Emerald and Elsevier as publishers. The shorting process can be seen in table 1.

No.	Variables	Number of articles generate by software	Number of articles that published by Emerald and Elsevier
1	Green accounting	230	21
2	Environmental accounting	981	108
3	Carbon accounting	980	62

Table 1: The Shorting Process of Research Journals

Application and development of review criteria methods

This step is also referred to as quality assessment. After the classification process observed in stage 2, we locate the articles and read them individually to identify the definition of each variable. Only those publications that explicitly define each variable were used in the analysis.

No.	Variables	Number of articles that published by Emerald and Elsevier	Number of articles use for analysis
1	Green accounting	21	6
2	Environmental accounting	108	8
3	Carbon accounting	62	4

Table 2: Relevant Journals Research

We also identify the most cited journals in this research. The result can be seen in table 3.

No	o Topic	Author and Year	Title	Number of Citations		Journal
1.	Green accounting	(Owen, Gray and	Green accountin	g: cosmetic irrelevance or	288	Asia-Pacific Journal of
		Bebbington, 1997)	radical agenda f	or change?		Accounting
		(Halberg,	Farm level enviro	onmental indicators; are		Agriculture,
		Verschuur and	they useful?: an	overview of green	220	Ecosystems and
		Goodlass, 2005)	accounting syste	ms for European farms		Environment
		(Gray and Laughlin, 2012)	It was 20 years accounting, aud journal, green ac meanies	ago today: Sgt Pepper, iting & accountability counting and the blue	188	Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal
2.	Environmental	(Boyd and	What are ecosyst	em services? The need for	3202	Ecological economics
	Accounting	Banzhaf, 2007)	standardized env	rironmental accoun		
		(Mathews, 1997)	Twenty-five Yea Environmental A There A Silver Ju	ars of Social and Accounting Research: Is Ibilee to Celebrate?	1239	Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal
		(Lohmann, 2009)	Toward a different environmental according to the carbon and cost	ent debate in ccounting: The cases of and benefit	487	Accounting, organizations and society
3. Carbon Accounti	Carbon Accounting	(Schaltegger and Csutora, 2012)	Carbon accounti management. Sta	ng for sustainability and atus quo and challenges	333	Journal of Cleaner Production
		(Stechemesser and Guenther, 2012)	Carbon accounti review	ng: a systematic literature	293	Journal of Cleaner Production
		(Unkovich, Baldock and Forbes, 2010)	Variability in har potential signific accounting: example	vest index of grain crops and cance for carbon nples from Australian	222	Advances in agronomy
			agriculture			

Table 3: Results of Data Extraction

Synthesis and Identification of Research Results

Green Accounting and Environmental Accounting

We will start by defining green accounting (table 4) and environmental accounting (table 5) using the term from the journal we chose based on the abovementioned criteria.

Author	Explicit Definitions of Green Accounting	Notes				
(Rubenstein, 1992)	"The essence of green accounting is accounting for the air we breathe, the water we drink."	2				
(Stanojević, Vranes and Gökalp, 2010)	"Green or environmental accounting describes an effort to incorporate environmental benefits and costs into economic decision making"	The definition is cited from Gernot Wagner				
(Ying <i>et al.</i> , 2011)	"Green accounting is a significant approach to establish a scientific perspective on how to manage the issues pertaining to environment protection and forest resource utilization and restoration."	-				
(Gray and Laughlin, 2012)	"The term, "green accounting" does continue in the environmental economics field however but for no reason we can discern. The move away from the term "green accounting" echoed a wider (but by no means universal) move away from labelling environmental concerns as simply "green" – a move, we assume, which reflected an attempt to distinguish between a populist if restricted notion and a more substantive and serious consideration of mankinds' relationship with natural ecology"					
(Rounaghi, 2019)	"Green accounting is a type of accounting that attempts to factor environmental costs into the financial results of operations."					
(Maama and Appiah, 2019)	Maama and ppiah, 2019) "Green accounting is, therefore, viewed as an important tool for gaining an understanding of the roles of business enterprises within an economy towards safety of the environment and welfare of the citizens."					

 Table 4: Explicit Definitions of Green Accounting

Table 5: Explicit Definitions of Environmental Accounting

Author	Explicit Definitions of Environmental Accounting	Notes
(Lehman, 1996)	"Environmental accountants define the environmental issue in terms of the divergence between full social costs created by economic agents and the actual costs incurred by that entity".	
(Solomon and	"Social and environmental accounting is defined as systems that provide	
Thomson, 2009)	information on the inflows, outflows and pools of natural, economic, cultural, ethical and social resources for different entities measuring their eco-efficiency, eco-effectiveness, social-efficiency or social-effectiveness."	
(Protogeros <i>et al.</i> , 2011)	"Environmental accounting is an important tool for understanding the role played by the natural environment in the economy. Environmental accounts may provide data which highligh both the contribution of natural resources to economic wellbeing and the costs imposed by pollution or resource degradation".	
(Stechemesser and Guenther, 2012)	"Environmental accounting as a subset of accounting that addresses "activities, methods and systems [as well as] recording, analysis and reporting of environ- mentally induced financial impacts and ecological impacts of adefined economic system (e.g. firm, plant, region, nation, etc.)"	The definition is cited from Schaltegger and Burritt (2000)
(Lockhart and M.R., 2015)	"We define environmental accounting as "accounting for the environment", which is therefore part of the broader corporate social reporting".	
(Rounaghi, 2019)	"Environmental accounting includes production, analysis and the use of information related to financial matters in the environment regarding the economic and environmental performances of a company."	
(Marrone <i>et al.</i> , 2020)	"Environmental accounting research examines how firms account for and discloses their environmental impacts as well as investigates the impact of environmental performance on firms' performance."	
(Ghosh and Wolf, 2021)	"Environmental Accounting is a means to strengthen procedural accountability, transparency, and improve returns and lower risks attached to conservation investments"	The definition is cited from (Smith <i>et al.</i> , 2019)

Based on the definition in Table 4, all the given definitions of green accounting refer to environmental

2364 Green Accounting, Environmental Accounting, and Carbon Accounting: Is It the Same?

accounting. Meanwhile, the environmental accounting definition in Table 5 focuses primarily on the environmental cost, environmental performance, or any data that businesses reveal to disclose their environmental impacts. Therefore, if the author wants to emphasize the connection between corporate operations and the natural environment, the researcher may utilize the concept of green accounting. On the other hand, the author can utilize environmental accounting to emphasize businesses' efforts connected to environmental performance, including disclosing their environmental costs and impacts. However, it is acceptable for researchers to interchange the terms environmental accounting and green accounting (ARUNACHALAM, CHINNARAJA, & MAYDEN, 2016).

Carbon Accounting

As with green accounting and environmental accounting, we will start with each author's carbon accounting definition. The definition can be seen in the table 6 below:

Author	Explicit Definitions of Carbon Accounting "we frequently hear talk of CO2 balancing or carbon accounting. What we mean in this case is the balancing of CO2 equivalents." (p. 20)										
(Schmidt, 2009)											
(Ascui and Lovell, 2011)	es ca me rej va ve au	timation lculation sasurement porting lidation riflication diting	of	carbon carbon dioxide greenhouse gas	emissions to the atmosphere removals from the atmosphere emission rights emission obligations emission reductions legal or financial instruments linked to the above trades/transactions of any of the above impacts on climate change impacts from climate change	at	global national sub-national regional civic organisational corporate project installation event product supply chain	level, for	mandatory voluntary	research compliance reporting disclosure benchmarking auditing information marketing or other	purposes
(Bowen and Wittneben, 2011)	"We the c	define ca commun	arbo icat	on accoun ion thereo	ting as the measuremen of, both within and bet	t of wee	f carbon em en firms" (p	ission . 102	(5)	ation of this	3 data and
(Stechemesser	: "carl	oon acco	unti	ng compri	ises the recognition, the	nor	n-monetary	and m	ionetary e	valuation an	d the
and Guenther	, mon	itoring o	f gr	eenhouse §	gas emis- sions on all lev	vels	ofthe value	chain	and the r	ecognition,	
2012)	evalu	ation and	l m	onitoring o	of the effects of these emi	ssio	ons on the ca	ırbon	cycle of e	cosystems."	(p.36)

Table 6: Explicit Definitions of Carbon Accounting

According to the definition in Table 6, carbon accounting refers to the measurement and or the recognition related to carbon emission. These definitions are different from green accounting and environmental accounting. Therefore, if the author would like to focus on companies' efforts in disclosing their carbon emission or the cost of carbon emissions, we suggest the author use the terminology of carbon accounting rather than green or environmental accounting.

Conclusion

Most of the article published does not start their article with definition. Some articles cite definitions from sources other than journals, such as books and websites. The results of this study show that, by definition, green accounting and environmental accounting refer to the same thing; therefore, this terminology can be used interchangeably.

However, carbon accounting is different from green and environmental accounting. The results of this study are expected to contribute to researchers and businesses, governments, and policymakers by providing accurate terminology to ensure consistency with the concept.

Bibliography

- Ascui, F. and Lovell, H. (2011) 'As frames collide: Making sense of carbon accounting', Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal, 24(8), pp. 978–999. doi: 10.1108/0951357111184724.
- Akman, O., Cairns, D., Comar, T. D., & Hrozencik, D. (2014). Integrated pest management with a mixed birth rate for prey species. Letters in Biomathematics, 1(1), 87-95.
- ARUNACHALAM, M., CHINNARAJA, S., & MAYDEN, R. L. (2016). On the identities of Hypselobarbus pulchellus (Day, 1870), H. dobsoni (Day, 1876), H. jerdoni (Day, 1870), and H. maciveri Annandale 1919 (Cypriniformes: Cyprinidae), with the description of a new species of Hypselobarbus from peninsular India. FishTaxa-Journal of Fish Taxonomy, 1(3).
- Bowen, F. and Wittneben, B. (2011) 'Carbon accounting: Negotiating accuracy, consistency and certainty across organisational fields', *Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal*, 24(8), pp. 1022–1036. doi: 10.1108/09513571111184742.
- Boyd, J. and Banzhaf, S. (2007) 'What are ecosystem services? The need for standardized environmental accounting units', *Ecological Economics*, 63(2–3), pp. 616–626. doi: 10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.01.002.
- Dalmazzone, S. and La Notte, A. (2013) 'Multi-scale environmental accounting: Methodological lessons from the application of NAMEA at sub-national levels', *Journal of Environmental Management*. Elsevier Ltd, 130, pp. 405–416. doi: 10.1016/j.jenvman.2013.09.008.
- Davis, J. et al. (2014) 'Viewing systematic reviews and meta-analysis in social research through different lenses', *SpringerPlus*, 3(1), pp. 1–9. doi: 10.1186/2193-1801-3-511.
- Deegan, C. (2013) "The accountant will have a central role in saving the planet. really? A reflection on "green accounting and green eyeshades twenty years later", *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*. Elsevier Ltd, 24(6), pp. 448–458. doi: 10.1016/j.cpa.2013.04.004.
- Ghosh, R. and Wolf, S. (2021) 'Hybrid governance and performances of environmental accounting', Journal of Environmental Management. Elsevier Ltd, 284(October 2020), p. 111995. doi: 10.1016/j.jenvman.2021.111995.
- Giraldi, L. M., Corrêa, T. R. K., Schuelter-Trevisol, F., & Gonçalves, C. O. (2019). Obito fetal: fatores obstétricos, placentários e necroscópicos fetais. Jornal Brasileiro de Patologia e Medicina Laboratorial, 55, 98-113.
- Gray, R. and Laughlin, R. (2012) 'It was 20 years ago today: Sgt Pepper, Accounting, Auditing &Accountability Journal, green accounting and the Blue Meanies', Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal, 25(2), pp. 228–255. doi: 10.1108/09513571211198755.
- Halberg, N., Verschuur, G. and Goodlass, G. (2005) 'Farm level environmental indicators; are they useful? An overview of green accounting systems for European farms', *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment*, 105(1–2), pp. 195–212. doi: 10.1016/j.agee.2004.04.003.
- Hopper, T. (2019) 'Stop accounting myopia: think globally: a polemic', *Journal of Accounting and Organizational Change*, 15(1), pp. 87–99. doi: 10.1108/JAOC-12-2017-0115.
- Lehman, G. (1996) 'Environmental accounting: Pollution permits or selling the environment', *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, 7(6), pp. 667–676. doi: 10.1006/cpac.1996.0075.
- Linnenluecke, M. K., Birt, J. and Griffiths, A. (2015) "The role of accounting in supporting adaptation to climate change", *Accounting and Finance*, 55(3), pp. 607–625. doi: 10.1111/acfi.12120.
- Linnenluecke, M. K. and Griffiths, A. (2013) 'Firms and sustainability: Mapping the intellectual origins and structure of the corporate sustainability field', *Global Environmental Change*. Elsevier Ltd, 23(1), pp. 382–391. doi: 10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2012.07.007.
- Lockhart, J. A. and M.R., M. (2015) 'Teaching Environmental Accounting: A Four Part Framework', Advances in Accounting Education Teaching and Curriculum Innovations, pp. 57–84.
- Lohmann, L. (2009) 'Toward a different debate in environmental accounting: The cases of carbon and cost-benefit', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*. Elsevier Ltd, 34(3–4), pp. 499–534. doi: KURDISH STUDIES

10.1016/j.aos.2008.03.002.

- Maama, H. and Appiah, K. O. (2019) 'Green accounting practices: lesson from an emerging economy', Qualitative Research in Financial Markets, 11(4), pp. 456–478. doi: 10.1108/QRFM-02-2017-0013.
- Marrone, M. et al. (2020) 'Trends in environmental accounting research within and outside of the accounting discipline', Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal, 33(8), pp. 2167–2193. doi: 10.1108/AAAJ-03-2020-4457.
- Mathews, M. (1997) 'Twenty-five Years of Social and Environmental Accounting Research: Is There A Silver Jubilee to Celebrate?', Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 10(4), pp. 481–531.
- Messinis, S., & Vosniakos, G. C. (2020). An agent-based flexible manufacturing system controller with Petri-net enabled algebraic deadlock avoidance. Reports in Mechanical Engineering, 1(1), 77-92.
- Owen, D., Gray, R. and Bebbington, J. (1997) 'Green Accounting: Cosmetic Irrelevance or Radical Agenda for Change?', *Asia-Pacific Journal of Accounting*, 4(2), pp. 175–198. doi: 10.1080/10293574.1997.10510519.
- Protogeros, N. et al. (2011) 'A software shell for environmental accounting', Environmental Modelling and Software. Elsevier Ltd, 26(2), pp. 235–237. doi: 10.1016/j.envsoft.2010.07.003.
- Rounaghi, M. M. (2019) 'Economic analysis of using green accounting and environmental accounting to identify environmental costs and sustainability indicators', *International Journal of Ethics and Systems*, 35(4), pp. 504–512. doi: 10.1108/IJOES-03-2019-0056.
- Rubenstein, D. B. (1992) 'Bridging the gap between green accounting and black ink', Accounting, Organizations and Society, 17(5), pp. 501-508. doi: 10.1016/0361-3682(92)90044-S.
- Schaltegger, S. and Csutora, M. (2012) 'Carbon accounting for sustainability and management. Status quo and challenges', *Journal of Cleaner Production*. Elsevier Ltd, 36, pp. 1–16. doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2012.06.024.
- Schmidt, M. (2009) 'Carbon accounting and carbon footprint more than just diced results?', *International Journal of Climate Change Strategies and Management*, 1(1), pp. 19–30. doi: 10.1108/17568690910934372.
- Smith, W. K. et al. (2019) 'Voluntary sustainability standards could significantly reduce detrimental impacts of global agriculture', Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 116(6), pp. 2130–2137. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1707812116.
- Solomon, J. F. and Thomson, I. (2009) 'Satanic Mills?. An illustration of Victorian external environmental accounting', *Accounting Forum*, 33(1), pp. 74–87. doi: 10.1016/j.accfor.2008.07.012.
- Stanojević, M., Vranes, S. and Gökalp, I. (2010) 'Green accounting for greener energy', Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 14(9), p. 2473. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2010.06.020.
- Stechemesser, K. and Guenther, E. (2012) 'Carbon accounting: A systematic literature review', *Journal of Cleaner Production*. Elsevier Ltd, 36, pp. 17–38. doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2012.02.021.
- Unkovich, M., Baldock, J. and Forbes, M. (2010) Variability in Harvest Index of Grain Crops and Potential Significance for Carbon Accounting: Examples from Australian Agriculture. 1st edn, Advances in Agronomy. 1st edn. Elsevier Inc. doi: 10.1016/S0065-2113(10)05005-4.
- Wade, B. and Griffiths, A. (2020) 'Examining Best Practice Carbon Management within Australian organisations: cases from contrasting sectors', *Australasian Journal of Environmental Management*. Taylor & Francis, 27(2), pp. 156–172. doi: 10.1080/14486563.2020.1747029.
- Weng, H. H. R., Chen, J. S. and Chen, P. C. (2015) 'Effects of green innovation on environmental and corporate performance: A stakeholder perspective', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 7(5), pp. 4997–5026. doi: 10.3390/su7054997.
- Ying, Z. et al. (2011) 'Green accounting for forest and green policies in China A pilot national assessment', Forest Policy and Economics. Elsevier B.V., 13(7), pp. 513–519. doi: 10.1016/j.forpol.2011.06.005.
- Wu, W., & Li, N. (2022). Application of virtual reality technology in multimedia resource with a focus on the COVID-19 outbreak. Journal of Commercial Biotechnology, 181-189. https://doi.org/10.5912/jcb1090